

# EXHIBIT

# 12

**Sandra Chan**

---

**From:** MARTIN QUINN <mq1942@me.com>  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 31, 2015 12:41 PM  
**To:** Mario Alioto  
**Cc:** Francis Scarpulla; Sandra Chan; Emilio Varanini; Marlo Cohen  
**Subject:** Re: CRT/Hearing on January 5, 2016

Dear Counsel: I have Mr. Scarpulla's letter e-filed with JAMS and Mr. Alioto's e-mail asking about procedure for the January 5 hearing. Mr. Scarpulla's letter also asks for the production of material prior to the hearing relating to expenses and fee calculations. I will issue an order on Mr. Scarpulla's requests, but wanted to let you know now my preferences.

First as to the hearing, it matters not to me how many firms want to participate in person or by telephone. However, I envision the hearing lasting about 2 hours max, so I would like some coordination among counsel as to who takes the lead in speaking. I really don't need to hear the same arguments from 5 different lawyers. There will be no formal examination or cross-examination. This is an opportunity for reasoned legal argument. I would like to hear first from whatever counsel are speaking for the objectors, basically responding to the points made in Lead Counsel's Reply Brief.

The principal issues that concern me are the objections raised on the basis that all the national class is not receiving compensation, the viability of an indirect purchaser claim in a non-repealer state, the reasons for not having representatives from the three repealer states, the propriety of the notice. I am far less interested in hearing argument about attorney fees and expenses, not because those issues aren't significant, but because I can make reasoned judgments on those issues without more argument. That doesn't mean I won't hear anything on those issues — just keep it to a minimum.

As to Mr. Scarpulla's requests for production, I am not going to grant them. None of the material he asks for seems to me necessary for me to make a reasoned decision on the request for total fees. They may become more relevant to the allocation phase, but I have quite enough material now to rely on for this phase. I believe Mr. Alioto is having his accountants perform a more detailed audit of the expense requests, and I will want to see the results of that early next week.

Martin Quinn  
Special Master

MARTIN QUINN  
JAMS  
Two Embarcadero Center, #1500  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
415-774-2669  
[mq1942@me.com](mailto:mq1942@me.com)

On Dec 31, 2015, at 1:20 PM, Mario Alioto <[MAlioto@TATP.com](mailto:MAlioto@TATP.com)> wrote: